

Rachel Jaffe

Journal club 3/27/2019

Comments to the Authors

Thank you for allowing me to review this article. The authors collected tuberculin surveys among school age children in Tanzania between 1990 and 2002 to see if BCG vaccination was associated with TST results. Comparisons among the three surveys that were included were used to draw conclusions to see if there was an association between BCG vaccination and TST results.

Upon revision, this article should be accepted for publication.

Major Concerns:

- Why are you publishing the results 16 years after the last survey was conducted?
- Could you please elaborate on the sentence in the results section that reads, “There were no notable differences between the included and excluded children except for BCG vaccination status, TST result, and TB in household for which there were differences in missing values (Data not shown).” Differences in TST result and BCG vaccination seem to be notable to me.
- In the discussion, you state, “These findings were consistent across the three surveys and the pattern was not affected by potential confounding by exposure to infectious TB and geographic or socio-economic variation.” How can you make this claim if you only had information about exposure to infectious TB, geographic location and socio-economic status for just survey four but not for the other two surveys?

Minor Concerns:

- I would consider removing the word ‘important’ in the first sentence of the introduction. Rather, I think the word significant would be a more appropriate choice.
- The discussion is heavy on others’ research rather than your own. I would consider cutting back on some of the information or moving it into the introduction.
- Please add a label to the x axis in Panel A, B, C and D survey graphs located in the discussion section.
- In methods, under survey procedures, could you please include how many people comprised the two teams that administered and read the results?
- In the acknowledgements you say there was no external funding for the analyses presented, but was there internal funding? How was this research funded?